Centre for International Environment and Development Studies
Noragric

NLH
AGRICULTURAL
UNIVERSITY OF NORWAY

Noragric SSE-project Review

Conservation and Rural Development Project in Tegulet and Bulga Wereda

(Wogda Project)

Northern Shoa, Ethiopia

IMPLEMENTED BY REDD BARNA-ETHIOPIA

JANUARY 1995

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The NORAGRIC team would like to express sincere gratitude to Redd Barna - Ethiopia (RB-E) and its staff, both at headquarters and in the field. Our appreciation is specially directed to the field staff who, under the leadership of the Project Manager Ato Solomon Kelkay, gave us enjoyable hospitality and assistance in the conduct of our mission. The field programme was well-planned and the nice reception we had in the villages we visited reflected the great appreciation Redd Barna has earned in the area. The smooth logistic arrangements and the warm hospitality of the social committee was highly appreciated. Allthough a short visit, we feel that due to the excellent organisation of the mission, we have obtained an overview of the progress and achievements of the project while having time for interesting discussions with key project staff.

Trygve Berg Sidsel Grimstad Aragay Waktola

Contents

Executive Summary

Background on the project and the review process

1. Redd Barna-Ethiopia (RB-E) has been active in Ethiopia since 1969. They were involved in the establishment and operation of the All African Leprocy Training and Rehabilitation Centre (ALERT) as well as Armauer Hansen Research Institute (AHRI), both based in Addis Ababa and sharing common premises. Their involvement in rural development activities came after the 1984/85 drought in response to the appeal made by the Ethiopian Relief and Rehabilitation Commission.

The overriding objective has been the reduction of vulnerability of poor people to draught and famine situations.

2. The Conservation and Rural Development Project, locally known as the Wogda Project was initiated in 1987, but the agreement was concluded in 1988. SSE funds were granted to RB-E in support of the following activities: agricultural development; soil and water conservation; afforestation; water supply (protection of springs, handdug wells); infrastructure development (construction of access roads and improved footpaths); and income generating activities.

3. The project has been rightly justified for ecological and social reasons that have undermined the ability of the people to produce and feed themselves. Wogda is made up of highland plateau and steep slopes with highly eroded soils. Deforestation has long been overdone. Climatic conditions have been taking adverse trends for many years culminating in the catastrophic drought of 1984/85. There has been little intervention both by government and NGOs until recently. The people themselves have been very stubborn and suspicious of any interference by outside agencies. Internal conflicts have been dealt with through self-justice and been destructive to the local community.

4. The duration of the project was originally 5 years. Due to political instability and the intensity of the civil war, project implementation failed to proceed as planned. The project area was totally evacuated on two occasions in 1990 and 1991. Project facilities were, however, well protected to enable resumption of activities when the situation was pacified in 1992. As a result, it can be reckoned that the project has been fully operational only for the last 2 years.

5. In view of RB-E intentions to phase out project activities in 1995, it was considered necessary to review the situation and examine the sustainability of the activities which by nature are mostly long term undertakings. A team from NORAGRIC was charged with this responsibility. The team was keenly interested to observe and learn from the phase-out arrangement considered by RB-E. It may be noted that this is the first SSE funded project in Ethiopia suggested for phase-out, with the assumption that project objectives have by and

large been achieved and that local institutions and the beneficiaries are in a position to continue with the development initiatives introduced by RB-E.

6. The team was in the project area for a period of one week. during which intensive discussions and interviews were conducted. Project documents and briefing notes supplied by the project staff, were examined to appraise the performance of the project and analyse the rationale for termination of SSE assistance as proposed by RB-E. There has been full co-operation from the project staff which the team wishes to acknowledge with gratitude.

Findings and Conclusions

7. Based on the field visit, interviews and discussions the following observations and suggestions are reflected in the main text of the report.

8. The activities designed in response to the food and environmental problems are appropriate and consistent with the objectives of the SSE Programme. These activities include, i) soil conservation, ii) reafforestation, iii) women income generation groups, iv) vertisol management, v) integrated vegetable production near natural springs, vi) introduction of fruit trees, and vii) animal husbandry. They are likely to contribute to the improvement of the food security situation if the present levels of implementation are strengthened and expanded in scope. A few comments on each of the activities could explain the point.

9. Regarding vertisol management which cover farm lands occupied by some 350 households, the achievements are very striking. Only very few innovative farmers may be considered "early adopters" have been involved. The remarkable point is that they have managed to adapt the available vertisol technology to the local situation and capability without the need for a broadbed maker as recommended by the ILCA group which devised the innovation. Vertisol is the dominant soil type on the lands of 350 farms in the project area. So far a few "early adopters" have started using the improved vertisol management techniques. These early adopters, however, have managed to adapt the recommended technology to their own resource poor context. Instead of using the "broadbed makers", they produce the "broadbeds and furrows" using their traditional tools. Yield increases ranging from 50 to 100% are reported by the farmers. The team was able to observe the good performance of the crops in the field. Allthough the technology does not require a high degree of inputs, farmers have repeatedly raised the constraints of input availability especially seeds. Marketing institutions are not yet in place to meet the growing demands. It is advisable that the project should continue to address this impressive development for some more years to come and investigate how availability of inputs could be ensured.

10. Vegetable production has been introduced along with the gravity-fed irrigation schemes. The scope of this development for this activity is rather limited because of the scarcity of water. It is however very instructive to observe how quickly farmers have responded to the scheme. We propose the conduct of a hydrological survey in the area to identify additional irrigation sites so that more farmers can benefit from vegetable production.

11. Another development opportunity in Wogda is the introduction of fruit production. We were surprised by the fact that fruits like banana and papaya were unknown in the project area, so close to main urban centres. School children are introduced to the consumption of such fruits, and farmers are showing increased interest. So far the project has established one fruit tree nursery in 1994, and the fruits from this activity has not yet been harvested. In order to ensure a more sustainable , both technical and institutional, basis for the development of fruit tree nurseries, support beyond 1995 is deemed necessary.

12. The animal husbandry component has been limited to the distribution of cows or oxen to vulnerable and needy housholds and the establishment of veterinary centres as well as training of veterinary scouts. These are important undertakings, but much more emphasis could have been made especially in the area of fodder production which is the most limiting factor in animal production.

13. The livestock sector is poor in the area. Unavailability of quality fodder is the main constraint and low productivity and overgrazing of communal lands is the result. The impact on environmental rehabilitation (considering that over-grazing is a major problem) from the animal husbandry activities chosen in the project must be regarded as limited. But changing this situation requires an intensive and long term effort on introduction of fodder herbs, trees and improved feeding practices. Given RB-Es limited time frame for projects, and their mandate and targetted households, the limited scope chosen for the animal husbandry components can be understood.

14. With respect to soil conservation, the extent of work done so far is impressive both in quantity and quality. Gully reclamation represent the most striking result of this activity. The physical structures, however, require a better organization to take on collective responsibility for maintenance which are not there at the moment, currently threatening these good achieve-ments. No one seems to care for common property. This remains to be a challenge to the project and the local government to install a sustainable system with the participation and support of the local people.

15. The lack of organisational responsibility for communal lands applies equally to the reforestation of communal lands and the development of larger nurseries for common use. The project should investigate different possibilities in order to ensure the continued production of seedlings after phase-out, either through privatisation, or handing-over to Service Cooperatives/Ministry of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection. The issue of how to cover the running costs for the big nurseries, must be dealt with in this context.

16. To conclude this section, progress of the women income generating groups will be highlighted. We noted with satisfaction that small loans for simple and achievable activities were in high demand and would have a considerable impact in the area if rendered sustainable structures. The IGA-groups, however, have only recently been established (1992-94) and need some continued support and training before they can stand by themselves. As they grow and expand, the need for a formal organisation and legal framework is obvious. This is well realised by the project, and it is hoped that a national policy will soon emerge to facilitate such a valuable activity.

17. Finally, we wish to reflect on the phasing out plan that RB-E is entertaining at the moment. We understand that phasing out implies a gradual handing-over of management responsibilities and recurrent costs to government, local organisation and/or the beneficiaries. It does not connote termination of activities because of the long term nature of the tasks involved. On the other hand we see little preparedness on the part of the recipients to assume full responsibilities to carry out the SSE-funded (Agric.development Environmental Rehabilitation and Women's Credit) components at this stage.

18. The team is convinced that RB-E's continuity for at least 2 more years beyond 1995 is necessary to help consolidate the achievements. This would allow time to strengthen local organisations to ensure sustainability. We also feel that a better assessment and monitoring of the project impact on the level of food production, food security and environmental rehabilitation should be undertaken before deciding on final withdrawal. In view of this we recommend that SSE funds be made available.

Abbreviations

AHRI	Armauer Hansen Research Institute
AISCO	Agricultural Input Supply Co-operatives
ALERT	All African Leprosy Training and Rehabilitation Centre
IGA	Income Generating Activities
MNREP	Ministry of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOH	Ministry of Health
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NORAGRIC	Centre for International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric
PA	Peasant Associations
RB-E	Redd Barna-Ethiopia
RRC	Relief and Rehabilitation Commision
SC	Service Cooperatives
SSE-Programme	Sudan-Sahel-Ethiopia-Programme
TGE	Transitional Government of Ethiopia

Introduction and Terms of Reference

1. Since 1991 NORAGRIC has been engaged to assist NORAD in the management and administration of part of the SSE-Programme that funds NGO-implemented projects in Ethiopia, Eritrea, Mali and Sudan. NORAGRICs role and mandate is, according to the agreement, to act as technical advisors for the NGOs involved in implementing projects and to review the projects for NORAD in order to ensure that projects are in compliance with SSE-objectives, sustainable and with a high degree of local participation ensuring a gradual take-over by local institutions. NORAGRIC should in relation to these tasks develop forums to enhance a sharing of experience and increased collaboration among NGOs.

2. According to the latest reports from the Redd Barna- Ethiopia, the "Conservation and Rural Development Project in Tegulet and Bulga" (named the Wogda project), implemented since 1987, has improved the food security situation in the project area to such an extent that Wogda is now self-sufficient with food and that local institutions had been adequately strengthened to take over the administration of the activities. Redd Barna-Ethiopia has therefore decided to terminate it's assistance in Wogda during 1995.

3. In view of the above, NORAGRIC suggested a review of the project, before the proposed phase-out, in order to examine the achievements of project objectives and the conditions laid out for sustainable development. NORAGRIC sent a team comprising Trygve Berg, Aragay Waktola and Sidsel Grimstad to review the project in the field from 16 to 19 November 1994.

4. NORAGRICs mandate in the management of the SSE-Programme and it's technical qualifications limits the review process to components that are funded through the SSE-Programme, which are agricultural development, envrionmental rehabilitation, water supply and income-generating activities. The terms of reference focussed specifically on the following 3 points: i) appropriateness of activities to the objectives set for the project; ii) review of project performance ; iii) rationale for phasing out arrangements and sustainability.

5. The observations of the team regarding each of these points are presented in this report. Implementation of such an integrated project, in the past turbulent years in Ethiopia has not been easy. The influence political/institutional changes have had and will have on the progress of the project, has been of special concern to the mission. An additional purpose of the review has been to observe and learn from the strategies and experiences of RB-E specifically with relation to phasing out of projects. The complete Terms of Reference for the NORAGRIC mission can be found in annex 2.

6. The field visit was facilitated by Redd Barna's head office in Addis Ababa and the Project Staff in Wogda. Redd Barna's senior consultant, Mr. Dub Gelma joined the team during the field visit and provided the team with written information and briefings. The main findings of the team was presented to Redd

Barna at Headquarters in Addis Ababa in a wrap-up meeting held on the 29 November 1994.

1.0 Background

1.1 The SSE-Programme

7. The Sahel-Sudan-Ethiopian Programme was established as a response to the serious droughts that struck the Sahelian countries in the mid-eighties. The main objective of the programme was to finance development initiatives in these areas through projects and research that would restore the degraded resources base. Approximately 50% of the programme-funds would finance agricultural development and environmental rehabilitation projects implemented by Norwegian and indigenous NGOs in Ethiopia, Sudan, Mali and lately Eritrea. The other half of the funds were channeled through multilateral agencies and regional NGOs and to research on sustainable agriculture. The projects were to be implemented with a high degree of local participation, and activities should be targetted towards women. The basic policies of Norwegian Development Aid should be followed and the projects should be designed in such a way that activities could be sustained by local institutions after external funding is terminated.

8. The SSE-funded NGO-projects are usually integrated agricultural/rural development projects, comprising components such as agricultural development (input distribution, promotion of sustainable and improved farming practices and crops, irrigation and livestock development), environmental rehabilitation (afforrestation works and soil and water conservation), and income-generating activities. Most projects also include some infrastructure development (roads, water supply) and some have components on health and education.

9. The SSE-Programme provides the NGOs with 100% financing from NORAD for their projects if they comply with the SSE objectives. As such the SSE-Programme deviates from NORADs NGO policy which demands a 20% contribution from the NGO itself. Where projects have a relatively larger focus on none-SSE-activities such as health and education, SSE-funds have been used for activities that would comply with the SSE-objectives while the NGO would use their own funds or other external sources to finance these activities.

1.2 Redd Barna-Ethiopia

10. Redd Barna is a non-political, non-racial, non-religious, non-profit voluntary independent Norwegian humanitarian organisation. It is a membership organisation comprising Norwegian individuals, local membership groups, enrolled sponsors, individual and company donors. The funds raised from membership is often topped up by funds from NORAD. The United Nations Declaration of Human Rights and the 1989 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child are the ideological basis for Redd Barna. Redd Barna is a member of the International Save the Children Alliance.

11. Redd Barna has been present in Ethiopia since 1969 when they assisted in establishing the All African Leprosy Training and Rehabilitation Centre (ALERT). Since this initial start it has progressively become involved in rural and urban development programmes with special focus on children. Redd Barna-Ethiopia (RB-E) was later registered as an independent NGO, and from 1980 it became operational. The main reasons for becoming operational were (as stated in RB-E's 25 year Jubilee Report) : " ... to ensure direct people's participation in planning and implementation in activities, to control flow of funds all the way to the final target, to reduce administrative costs, to act as a bridge for direct partnership between Ethiopian and Norwegian children and ensure proper flow of information and education towards the Norwegian public." At the same time, it was clearly realised that the operational project model should strengthen the local coping mechanism; not replace them. The change in policy led to a rapid increase in staff and currently RB-E has a staff of around 375. However, only 3 Norwegian staff members are located at head-quarters.

12. Over the last 25 years, RB-E has registered a total of 53 projects. Out of these 24 were relief/rehabilitation projects, 17 operational projects, 9 sponsorship/grant aided and 3 were a mix of sponsorship and operational projects. Of the 17 directly operated projects, 8 have already been phased out, while of the remaining on-going project, 3 were initiated in 1994. From 1990 RB-E strengthened its emphasis and professional competence to become more child-centered in its approaches. Of the operational projects, 7 have been rural development projects of which 5 are still on-going. RB-E's current operating budget is approximately NOK 60 million annually.

13. Rural development projects generally comprise the following major components: Health, Agriculture, Income-Generation, Community Development and Infrastructure. The main objective is to assist vulnerable households to overcome their poverty through the establishment of basic social services and increase their opportunities to improve their level of food production or income. RB-E emphasises that community participation is the key to development. The implementation of each component as well as all financial, administrative and personnel matters follows well defined operational guidelines, developed and incorporated in the Local Programme Handbook for RB-E in 1990. Prior to implementation an agreement is signed with Ethiopian Relief and Rehabilitation Commission (RRC) and concerned Government bodies. RB-E programmes are required to follow Government development plans and priorities. From here on all agreements are to be concluded with Regional Governments.

14. RB-E offers a high degree of internal training for its staff, comprising such themes as : Communication skills, Child Development Strategy, Community Diagnosis related to Child Development, Mediated Learning Experience, Logical Framework Approach and Participatory Rural/Urban Appraisal Techniques.

15. In summary, RB-E has developed good guiding principles and training opportunities to its staff on how to implement projects. The focus on local participation to develop a strong feeling of partnership feeling between RB staff and local beneficiaries.

2.0 Project Overview

2.1 Project Area and Resource Base

16. The project was originally called the Soil Conservation and Rural Development Project (SSE-001-026), but is locally known as the Wogda Project. It comprises the Debre Berhan Zuria Woreda in the Northern Shoa Zone of Region 3, and is located around 140 km north of Addis Ababa. It consists of a mountain plateau between the two deep river gorges of Chacha and Beressa rivers at altitude ranging between 1600 to 2800 metres. Soils on the plateau comprise areas of black cotton soil (vertisols), courser and often rocky soils in the slopes. The area has two rainy seasons , the short belg season from February to April and the long meher season from June to August. The project area covers approximately 207 km2.

17. The project centre is within 18 km of Debre Berhan which is the capital and main commercial outlet of the zone; 130 km north of Addis Ababa. Superficially, it appears that this location has a comparative advantage. But in reality the people in the project area have lived in virtual isolation due to the inaccessibility of the area.The topography makes transportation difficult, and no roads existed before the project intervention.

18. A baseline survey was undertaken in 1986, and reported that agriculture was the main activity in the area; with barley, wheat, teff, maize and sorghum as main cereal crops. In the highlands different types of pulses are grown extensively. Livestock comprise cattle, sheep and goats for which grazing areas are very limited.

19. Due to population density there was no room for fallow in the crop rotation. Pests and recurrent droughts since the 1980s represent continuous hazards to the crops which increasingly are limited by erosion and lack of addition of organic matter. Since firewood is scarce, cowdung is the main source of energy for cooking and is even sold at markets nearby.The report suggested the need for intensive efforts in afforrestation of individual and communal lands, improved livestock management, improved grazing practices by introduction of fodder trees and crops to reduce grazing pressure on already degraded lands, rehabilitation of soil fertility by introducing soil organic matter through using cow-dung and pulses, and reclamation of land through stone and biological terracing.

2.2 The Target Population

20. The targetted population is calculated to approximately 27.000 with children under 15 years constituting about 35 % of the population. In the basic project document from 1985 it was stated that of the 26 Peasant Associations in the area, 65 % had been defined as drought stricken, which accounted for around 15,300 people. The society is homogenous, all belonging to the same ethnic group, Amhara, and religion, the Orthodox Church. They live in scattered homesteads defensibly placed for protection against internal and external threats.

21. The land-holding system is a variation of the communal system locally recognized as rist right. Accordingly, any individual, be it male or female, is entitled to equal usufruct right over the holding so long as kinship ties can be established with the original owner. Upon death the land is divided equally among all children wherever they may be residing. This has encouraged continued fragmentation of land. Conflicts arising from claims and counterclaims have been causing bloodshed among family members. The farmers are organised in 26 Peasant Associations and alltogether 5 Service Cooperatives.

22. Wogda is topographically a remote and inaccessible area, and when the project started, almost completely without any modern infrastructure. People were used to self-rule and preferred as little involvement as possible from the Government and other external agencies. Under these circumstances Redd Barna was introduced in the area. They were met by a suspicious local community thinking that Redd Barna are "Cubans, that they are Muslims and that they will take away children" (Janne Lexow in a Socio-Economic Study of the Wogda area). The social climate among people themselves was also recognized by extreme suspicion and killings due to bloodfeuds has in some villages resulted in 50% of the households being without fathers. The remoteness of the area had developed a strong sense of self-justice and the rule was that every household had arms. In this environment Redd Barna would necessarily use some time to create trust and cooperation with people.

2.3 The Project Objectives and Components

23. Redd Barna Ethiopia submitted a basic project document and proposal for funding of a 4-5 year project to RRC on 26 November 1985. The main objectives of the project as described in the document were rural development with the aims of reducing vulnerability of drought victims to famine in the longterm for the population in Tegulet and Bulga (Wogda). Through an integrated community development approach, RB-E would assist the population in realizing goals of self-reliance, decentralisation and improvement in social and economic development at the community level with in the framework of the Governments National Development Plans and cultural identity of the target population.

24. Three main immediate objectives were stated as follows:
- To provide enough grain for distribution at strategic points to prevent famine in affected areas and reverse exodus of the rural population.
- To link food-aid with rural development schemes that will preserve soil and make better use of water resources.
- To link these Ecological activities with improved access to health services and education through a process of integrated rural community development based on a participatory consept.

25. Apart from the above objectives, there are no quantified overall targets for the project. An evaluation in relation to set targets can thus be made only on an assumption of the above objective of reducing the vulneraibility of the population to drought and food insecurity. 65% of the target population are identified as victims of drought.

26. The following components were designed and incorporated into the project; Soil and Water conservation, Reafforestation, Health and Nutrition/Clinics, Education/Schools, provision of improved agricultural inputs and infrastructure. Eventually, these were operationalised into the following activities :

i) Agricultural development, (Input and tool distribution, Farmers training in livestock and vertisol management, Small irrigation schemes for vegetable gardens, Fruit tree nurseries, Oxen and cow distribution to needy households, veterinary services and training of veterinary agents)
ii) Environmental Rehabilitation (Stone bund terracing, Biological terracing with aloe, Gully control and checkdams, Tree seedling nurseries, Afforrestation of communal lands)
iii) Water supply (Protection of springs, Handdug wells)
iv) Infrastructure development (Construction of roads and improved footpaths)
v) Primary health care (Clinics, Health stations, Training of Traditional Birth Attendants (TBAs) and Child Health Assistants (CHAs)
vi) Education (Primary schools, Literacy centres and training of literacy teachers)
vii) Income generation and Crafts (Establishment of Self-financing grinding mills, Establishment of Income-generating womens groups in shoats-fattening, petty trade, brewing and seed purchase)

2.4 Funding of Project

27. The project was initiated in 1987, and an agreement was signed with RRC in the first quarter of 1988. In 1987 RB-E distributed large amounts of relief food (40 tons) into the area. According to the basic document, funding was originally expected from Bandaid/Liveaid, but from 1989 RB-E received SSE-funds for components concerning SSE-objectives ; agricultural development, soil and water conservation, afforestation, water supply and income generating activities. The other components have been financed by RB's own funds and by Lions club. Total annual project costs has been from 3 to 7 million NOK, of which SSE-funding has amounted to between 1.5 to 3.0 million NOK Due to the envisaged phasing out in 1995, RB has only applied for approximately 1million NOK for 1995.

2.5 Organisation and Operational Principles for Phasing Out

28. In the Wogda project, RB is an implementing organisation. This includes the establishment of a project team who implements the project. In Wogda there are a total of 32 staff. The organisational chart can be seen in annex 1. All staff members speak amhara and should therefore have the best possibilities of communicating with the local population.

29. The Operational Guidelines in the Local Programme Handbook provides clear guidelines/instructions on handing over of activities and phasing out of projects. According to these, formal structures like schools, clinics and health stations should be formally handed over to the responsible line ministries after

they have appointed personnel for these facilities. Activities like larger nurseries and grinding mills should be handed over to Service Cooperatives and be made sustainable as private enterprises, allthough auditing would be handled by MOA regional authorities. Peasant Associations should be trained to introduce new agricultural techniques and to organise maintenance of soil conservation structures and management of afforestated areas. PAs would also be responsible for small nurseries. Informal women groups involved in income-generating activities would be assisted (training and capital funds) to become economically independent able to undertake accounting and lending activities continue by themselves.

2.6 Timeframe and Project History

30. The area was identified by the Relief and Rehabilitation Commision (RRC) in 1985. The project started as a response to the 1984/85 drought with food-aid and food for environmental rehabilitation and community works.

31. In 1989 an evaluation of the project was carried out, concluding that the project would need to become more participatory in order to develop sustainability in the long-term. The project staff responded to this by implementing more village level meetings, organising groups and increasing their collaboration with the PAs and SCs in the area. Unlike most other areas in Ethiopia, these institutions had only to a limited extent been used as instruments of represseion and implementation of unpopular policies and therefore still had some credibility in the population.

32. The original time frame of the project when initiated in 1987, was 5 years. In 1992 due to political instability and security problems it was decided to extend the project for another 3 years, with phasing out by the end of 1995. However, in 1989 the war front crept closer to the project area, resulting in full evacuation of the project staff on two incidents in 1990 and 1991, and thus a halt in all project activities. Fortunately, during this tough period, the RB project compound and the Service Cooperative buildings remained unlooted by the local population, proving the support RB and the SCs had among the villagers. In other areas such infrastructure was totally destroyed. When RB staff returned in 1992 the activities became more focussed, and local participation was stressed.

33. With this background, it is clear that the project has only been implemented in full efficiency the last two years. These years are characterised by absence of clear policy framework. The Transitional Government of Ethiopia (TGE) coming to power after the downfall of the Derg-regime in May 1991, suspended most institutions and policies crucial for development and nature management. The current debates on revision of the entire governmental structure has left local communities, regional administrations and projects in uncertainty on major issues, such as input distribution and pricing policies, land tenure and marketing systems.

34. These uncertainties are slowly being settled. A landmark in the formalisation of new policies was the Constituent Assembly passing the new Constitution on December 12, 1994, defining national policies on issues such as

division of power between the national and regional Governments, land tenure, and thereby also the structure of agricultural institutions.

3.0 Agricultural Development

35. The traditional farming system is based on production of cereals and grain legumes. Crops, such as vegetables and fruits have been unknown. Livestock, mostly cattle and sheep, and donkeys or mules for transport, are fed by crop residues and by grazing the more or less degraded off farm lands. The highland plateaus comprise fertile vertisol soils, but which with traditional tilling obtain extremely low yields due to water-logging. Likewise the degraded lands are so poor that they are hardly worth being tilled. Because of lack of wood most of the animal dung is dried and burned as fuel or sold for cash.

36. Redd Barna's response to the agricultural production and environmental rehabilitation problems was to design an intervention programme including the following activities:

(1) Vertisol management,
(2) Irrigated vegetable production near natural springs,
(3) Introduction of fruit trees,
(4) Animal husbandry

37. We find these activities relevant to improve the food security situation in the area. Adoption of these activities is also facilitated by the fact that they do not require excessive use of expensive external inputs. Weak points related to these activities are that they require a high degree of farmers awareness, knowledge and organisation, and depend on technical follow-up from the extension services.

38. It is also clear that the magnitude of these problems created by a process of continuous degradation and increasing population the last centennials can not be solved by one project alone. It requires, as clearly stated in the report by Johan Helland, that the project initiates a process whereby the people themselves can understand the need and organise further efforts by themselves.

3.1 Vertisol Management

39. The improved technology is called "broadbed and furrows". Planting on slightly elevated beds between furrows that drains off the surface water, can make a tremendous difference compared to flat land with the associated waterlogging problems. The research institutions who developed this tecnology (ILCA/ICRISAT/IAR/AUA/AAU: the latter 3 are Ethiopian Institutions) made special tools for making the beds. The farmers have, however, managed to adapt the technology to their own resource poor context and make the beds with their traditional tools. They claim that it does not require more work than traditional tilling. So far a few "early adopters" have started using this technology (one

farmer in 1993, while 53 in 1994). But their fields are so impressive compared to those of their neighbours, that a rapid spread is likely.

40. The early adopters have been assisted in obtaining improved seeds and fertiliser through the MOA/Service Cooperatives. The yields were said to be around 50 to 100 % higher than average yields in the area. Even higher yields can be obtained with the use of improved seeds and fertlizers.

41. There is a high demand for improved seeds in the area, as both the early adopters of the vertisol techniques and women in IG-groups borrow money for the purchase of these inputs. The availability of these seeds seem, however, to be frail. In 1993 the drought situation in the county resulted in all improved seeds were used for famine relief elsewhere. It is vital to find a solution to this problem as it is important for the food security situation in the area. The project should investigate how seeds can be more securely supplied through traditional channels (SCs and MOA) or organising PAs in purchasing the seeds directly through commercial traders. In addition the project could encourage local seed selection and the use of enhanced local seeds (e.g. through the project "Seeds for Survival"-Ethiopia, Dr. Melaku Worede).

42. The design of this activity seems to be well-adapted to the local communities, and the potential yield increase is very encouraging and apparently spreading fast. It can contribute to major increases in food production depending on the support system. Even though significant yield increases can be obtained without use of improved seeds and fertilisers, increases are substantially higher with the use of these inputs. The project should develop a strategy how to assist farmers in ensuring themselves availability of inputs.

3.2 Gravity Fed Irrigated Vegetable Crops

43. Because of scarcity of water, gravity fed irrigation is only possible at a few places and for limited areas. 3 irrigation schemes have been implemented and have been functioning for 4 years. Where implemented, it has been a success in the sense that participating farmers have started growing vegetables, started using them both for food and cash crops, and clearly expressed that this is beneficial and profitable for them. According to the project staff the division of irrigated land among farmers had been undertaken by farmers themselves and as such had not created any problem for the RB-E. As the schemes are gravity fed, they do not require coverage of running costs other than labour for maintenance. The project has trained around 250 farmers in the maintenance and use of irrigation systems. A recurrent problem is the availability of horticultural seeds. These can only be found in Addis Ababa.

44. The design of these gravity fed irrigation schemes seems good, but is naturally limited due to lack of water. A survey of additional suitable sites for such schemes and the training of farmers in the technique should be undertaken before phase-out.

3.3 Introduction of Fruit Trees

45. Fruits are traditionally not grown in the area, and interviewed farmers even said that they had no previous knowledge of fruits. There are certainly temperate species of fruits which may thrive in the highest plateaus, and tropical or subtropical species which may be grown in the bottoms of the valleys. But so far, no cultivation at all.

46. A fruit nursery with banana, enset, papaya, citrus and coffee is recently started in a lowland site (Moi) with ample supply of water. The nice growth of all the species show the potential and the suitability of this activity, but distribution of seedlings to farmers has not yet started. The farmer responsible for the nursery had not even tasted the yield of the first papaya-harvest. Thus introduction of fruit trees needs more time in order to get a permanent foothold in the area. Fruit trees take some time before they bear fruits and as such have a longer time-frame than other crops. The project had tried to deal with this problem by introducing papaya species giving yields after only 6 months. Fruits is currently not a part of the farmers diet, but children have been introduced to fruits in school in order to get a taste for it.

3.4 Animal Husbandry

47. The animal husbandry component has been concentrated on 3 activities :
   i) the distribution of cows or oxen to specifically needing households, such as women-headed households,
   ii) the establishment of veterinary centres and
   iii) the training of farmers in improved animal husbandry.

48. It must therefore be stated that from the initial stage of project design, the project has not had the ambition to implement a general livestock development component, but has focussed on a few achievable activities with precisely targetted beneficiaries. This is somwhat in conflict with the recommendations from the initial baseline survey, but the review team finds the chosen activities approapriate considering the limited time-frame and institutional set-up RB-E implements projects with.

49. The distribution of animals has functioned as a social assistance programme for vulnerable and particularly needy households, and has had a beneficial impact on diet, cash and labour resources of the recipient household. It was the teams impression that there had not been associated with enough support for improved animal husbandry by project staff and extension services, thus reducing the positive impact improved feeding and other improved practices could have had.

50. Distribution of foddertree seedlings had been attempted in the beginning of the project on communal lands, but the seedlings had been grazed by animals. After that no further promotional activity had been attempted. This activity had deserved a stronger focus by the project. More innovative approaches could have been used to promote fodder trees and other more intensive fodder growing as over-grazing is one of the most serious problems in the area.

51. The infrastructure for 4 veterinary posts had been finalised, the first two in 1992, the last in 1994, and veterinary scouts have been trained in veterinary treatment for 3 months, and the first batch of drugs has been supplied by Redd Barna. The vet-posts have been linked to the Service Cooperatives, which have agreed that 30% of the profit earned from the grinding mills would be used for salaries to and training of the Veterinary Scouts and the Child Health Assistants. After an initial batch of drugs has been supplied by Redd Barna, the drugs would be sold at costprice and used to create a revolving fund to replenish the vet post with drugs from MOA. Auditing of the Service Cooperatives and the vet.posts has been transferred to MOA. The institutional arrangements seems to be well coordinated with both the SCs and MOA, and phasing out can take place without serious halts in the activity.

4.0 Environmental Rehabilitation

52. The area consists of highland plateaus and steep slopes descending from the top plateaus to the rivers in the bottom of deep gorges. In the slopes most of the land is degraded, sometimes so degraded that it is not even useful for pasture. When Redd Barna came to the area, the forest was all gone. Trees were left only in the homestead compounds and around the churches. Planting trees and protecting forests on communal lands were effectively discouraged by government policies which made all forests to become government property with no community's rights of use, only obligations to protect. Through food-for-work Redd Barna has implemented major activities in Soil Conservation and Reafforestation to rehabilitate the environment.

4.1 Soil Conservation

53. Stone terraces, stone bunds and aloe bunds as well as gully protection works have been made. The project documents indicate that approximately 1500 km of terraces has been constructed, of which 56 km have been made using aloe in biological terracing. The extent of the work is impressive. Also the quality seems good, particularly in the case of gully reclamation which requires very skilled stone works. For the construction of check dams and gully reclamation it is reported that approximately 10.554m3 of stones has been moved.

54. These works have been done through food-for-work in the drought and emergency relief situation during the first 2 years of the project (1986-87) and later on a cost-sharing basis, where the project would pay 2 birr/day and the farmers would contribute labour worth of 2 birr/day to this. The project would undertake training of farmers and would organise groups which would be responsible for maintenance.

55. The terraces work efficiently and had reclaimed considerable areas of cultivable land. The extent had not been quantified by RB staff. It is evident that the massive terracing work has contributed to food security. An assessment should be done in order to estimate the impact of this activity. A general trend

was that farmers also to some degree have started to construct their own terraces without compensation.

56. However, the terraces inspected already (after 3 years) show serious signs of deterioration due to lack of maintenance. The issue of organising maintenance commitees needs to be adressed and solved before the project pulls out. There are several obstacles to this that was mentioned during our field trip. First of all is the lack of clarity on land tenure for areas that are not cultivated, but are being reclaimed through gully control measures. These areas are considered "no-man's-land" and therefore nobody feels a special responsibility for maintenance of the gully control constructions. This may be settled at policy-level through the new constitution, but still a change in mentality remains. For the maintenance on the cultivated fields, there were some complaints from farmers that very hard and labourious work would need cash in order to be carried out.

57. These statements show that the farmers do not show real ownership for these structures. The PAs do not seem to be able to create adequately strong cohesion among farmers to be able to organise these works. A higher degree of awareness of common benefits must be reached before this activity can stand on its own and continuous maintenance is ensured.

58. It is also evident that there is a bottom-less need for the continuation of this activity, which really provides considerable rehabilitation of the environment and food security.

59. Implementation of soil conservation measures was in 1992 transferred from the Ministry of Agriculture to the then established Ministry of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection (MNREP). This has led to fragmentation of roles and responsibilities so that in the local administration there is extension agents responsible for MNREP issues longside extension agents responsible for agricultural development. The heads of zonal offices of the two ministries did not see this as a serious problem since there was close collaboration both at zonal and at field level. 6 months ago (June 1994) an extension agent from the MNREP had been located in the project area in order to follow-up on environmental rehabilitation activities, including soil conservation and afforestation.

60. In summary this indicates that some more time would be recommendable in order to see the government structures stabilise and to develop sustainable institutions for maintenance.

4.2 Tree Nurseries and Reafforestation

61. This is a major component and serve two purposes:
(i) to supply fuelwood and building materials for domestic use or sale,
(ii) to contribute to environment rehabilitation.

In response to this the project has succeeded in establishing a number of nurseries with capability of producing tree seedlings in extensive quantities, to distribute large quantities of seedlings (3.7 million) for private plots, and to a limited extent reafforestation on communal land. There are two big nurseries

which propagate around 600.000 seedlings annually in plastic pots using paid labour. These nurseries distribute seedlings for free to individual farmers and for planting on communal land. Initially the big nurseries started off with 9 different species, both indigenous and exotic trees for firewood and construction, fodder trees and trees for consumption purposes (hops). Currently only eucalyptus and hops seedlings are being propagated. 8 individual nurseries have also been established each producing approximately 20.000 bare-root eucalyptus and hops seedlings for sale.

62. Farmers have high demands for seedlings for private plots around the homesteads, but disinterest in planting trees in communal lands. People's demand has given all priority to fast-growing eucalyptus and hops for beer-brewing.

63. The lack of promotion of other tree crops must be considered a weakness of the project. Although people demand income-generating trees only, the project could have promoted other trees and especially fodder and fruittrees as test cases within compounds in order to make local population aware of the potential for consumption and improved livestock-feeding.

64. The government policy of declaring all forest of more than one hectar state property with no rights for the community, has worked as an efficient disincentive for involvement in reafforestation to any extent. According to these rules plots under 10 ha should be administered by PAs, plots over 10 ha should be administered directly by the government. Again new policies may change this situation and most likely bring incentives for community management of forest on communal lands.

5.0 Water Supply

65. The water supply component comprises the protection of springs and construction of hand-dug wells. Protection of springs is done by construction of sealed intake reservoirs with a protected tap for drinking water, a separate basin for cloth washing and separate troughs for watering livestock. All in all 12 springs have been protected. Previously all these activities would be undertaken in the same waterhole. One hand-dug well has been dug on the plateau. 90 farmers have recieved training in water management.

66. The team did not see the hand-dug well, but saw several protected springs. These seem to function efficiently, but some improvements in the design could be made. Specifically should the design of watering points for animals be improved regarding the sizes of the livestock troughs and the location of them.

67. Water availability is a major constraint in the area, and water-gathering is a heavy burden on the women. The problem in increasing the number of hand-dug wells was not discussed in depth. For the protected springs, the team would recommend that the project finds ways of transferring the technology and train the concept of spring protection to the SC or farmers groups in order for them to construct such facilities by themselves and improve the design if needed.

6.0 Women Income Generating Activities

68. The women income-generating groups were only initiated in 1991 when 6 groups were established. The number has increased rapidly, and by September 1994 the number of groups have amounted to 41, with 725 members reaching approximately 3500 beneficiaries (children, and other economically dependent relatives of the member). Of the total number of beneficairies about 50% are under 15 years old. The project targets women that are poor mothers (often single heads of household) with many children, but that are able to undertake work.

69. The sources of finance for the groups are the members monthly savings (from 25 cents to 1 birr), interest on loans (1 % interest per month) and a topping up of the funds with grants from Redd Barna. As of September 1994 total savings and interest accounted for around 38 % (Birr 30,310) while the Redd Barna grant accounted for Birr 49,400 (62%). Currently the assets were Birr 3,081 (29%) cash at hand and Birr 56,629 (71%) as receivables, loans to members. Loan sizes vary according to accumulated capital, often starting the first year with loans of Birr 50-60 for each member. Main activities are :

i) sheep and goat fattening - 52%,
ii) petty trade - 32,5 %,
iii) preparing and selling local drinks - 7.5 %,
iv) purchase of improved seeds - 7,5%.

70. The women's groups have formalized book-keeping and every member has a personal savings book. Literacy is rare among members, but in general at least 2-3 members are able to read and write and undertake book-keeping. The monthly payment meeting is always supervised by an external person. This is normally literacy teachers who have been specifically trained to undertake this work. Redd Barna staff train and supervise the literacy teachers work every two months. The womens groups also recieve assistance from MOA personnel when selecting animals for fattening schemes.

71. At the moment literacy training and teachers are fully financed by Redd Barna. The supervision system that has been developed for the IGA-groups, will come to a rapid halt when external funding stops. Ways of integrating this effort with the national system should be explored

72. The relative remoteness of the Wogda has left women un-exposed to perform income-generating activities. Training and support for these groups therefore is needed for some time in order for the IGA-groups to be able to continue by themselves. It is also important that a system of external supervision continues in order to prevent misuse of funds. The project has indicated that it would try to transfer this task to the Service Cooperatives. Project staff claimed that the women were not happy with this solution as they did not trust the SCs. The project must therefore before phasing out find a solution that is agreable to the women and will be sustainable in the long run. Another problem is that these groups only have a status as informal credit and savings groups with no overall legal framework. As long as the groups remain self-helped, using only their own funds as revolving funds and with the ability to safe-guard their money, this is not a problem. However, if the groups wants to

expand and eventually search funds or establish an account in a formal bank, they can not do so if the IGA-group is not registered within a legal framework.

73. RB-E is currently developing a strategy and design for a national credit scheme based on their experience with the women IGA-groups and where the issue of legal framework is adressed. It seems however that there is still some time to go before such issues have been settled within the current changing institutional context.

74. The above elements indicate that there is need for more time both to stabilise the groups and make them more self-reliant. The issue on external supervisor needs to be settled and also the issue of a legal framework for the groups.

7.0 Project Impact according to SSE-objectives

75. The main objective of both the project and that of the SSE-Programme is to enhance food security and environmental rehabilitation. For the project it is specifically stated that it intends to reduce the drought stricken population's vulnerability to famine. According to RB-E the population that was defined as drought-struck in 1985 was around 65% or approximately 15,300 people.

76. In project documents it is stated that after the drought years of 1986/87, there has been no need for relief food in the area. However, it stands to be proved whether this is true since no conclusive evaluation/assessment of project impact on food security has been made. There is no compilation or assessment of how many of the target population have been reached and if their standard of living/food security has now improved to such an extent that they can be considered not vulnerable to drought. Interviews the team had with farmers, indicate that they do not have adequate margins of food or capital to buffer frequently occurring incidents such as drought, pests, frost and lack of inputs/seeds. The general degradation of the resource base and the increasing population also indicate that there is a continuous need for increasing food production.

77. The project has monitored some aspects of food security through the assessments of crops for early warning towards needs for relief food. This is done every 6 months. It has also monitored the nutritional status of children under 5 years, done as cluster surveys every 6 months. The latest survey from summer 1994 found the nutritional status to be 93.5% satisfactory for the measured children.

78. The project should develop a system for assessing the impact on food security and environmental rehabiliation from each activity in order both to evaluate where more emphasis and assistance needs to be undertaken and where there is a need to train and strengthen institutions that can continue the somewhat bottomless need for improvements in these areas. Below are the team's comments on the impact on SSE-objectives of each activity.

79. The impact of vertisol management on food security is difficult to determine, but according to figures presented, yield increases have been estimated to be from 50 to 100%. In the project area it was estimated that approximately 350 households or approximately 1750 - 2450 beneficiaries (5-7 persons per household) had access and could benefit from improved vertisol management. If one estimates that these households through the substantial yield increase reported could become permanently food secure, the project impact would have improved the situation for approximately 10 % of the targetted population. Another question is whether these adopters have been drought victims.

80. The food security impact of the gravity fed irrigation schemes has not been estimated. There are 2 food security aspects of these schemes, one is the direct increase in food production, the other the potential income it might generate through marketing of produce. The 3 schemes comprise approximately 30 households each and as such must be said to reach a minor part of the total population of 27,000. For these households a substantial income might be generated as the distance to the market in Debre Berhan is short, and marketing should be fairly easy for a substantial amount of produce. According to farmers they could produce 2 to 3 crops a year. An assessment of income or increased food security as the result, has not been made.

81. The impact of introducing fruit trees in the area has up to now been limited, as only one fruit tree nursery has been established in 1994, and the first seedlings have yet to be distributed. The main impact on food security would be potential income and a more varied diet. There is a high potential for fruit trees in the lower area of Wogda and the activity could potentially give substantial impact on both income and diet. The project activity would need some additional years before impact and dissemination of these new crops can be assessed.

82. The impact on food security due to animal husbandry activities have not been estimated. The alltogether 335 households that have recieved either cows or oxen have been helped. The cows have given the family an additional protein source through milk production. However, no recording on how families where able to improve fodder practices, had been done. There is no recording of how many people per household has actually benefitted from this activity. As the animals which are given on grant basis to the needy, they are a potential capital and can serve as a sales-object and security in times of little food.

83. Beneficiaries of the water supply component is difficult to quantify as the protected springs have only improved the hygienic situation in relation to water and not as such increased access to water. It is evident that this activity has had a beneficial impact on both human and animal health. An impact assessment of the activity related to spreading of deseases and thereby food security, should have been made.

84. There has been no visible impact on environmental rehabilitation of the promotion of better fodder practices. Fodder tree distribution has not been attempted after the initial years of implementation of the big nursery in Genet. This activity had deserved a stronger focus by the project. More innovative

approaches could have been used to promote fodder trees and other more intensive fodder growing.

85. The impact on environmental rehabilitation of the immense terracing and gully control work undertaken in the area has not been assessed. It was however clear during the field visit that considerable areas of cultivable land has been reclaimed. The project should assess the area reclaimed and the potential impact this has on environmental rehabilitation, food production and food security for the farmers in the area. A quantification of how many households has benefitted from these activities should be established. It is also important to show what considerable values are at risk if these constructions are not properly maintained.

86. The tree-planting activities in the area has been concentrated to individual farmer's land comprising mainly eucalutys and hops for income-generation. The eucalyptys would be used for house construction after 5-10 years. The area covered by all together 3,7 million seedlings should be assessed, along with the survival rates of the trees and how many farmers have benefitted from this activity. There is no recording of no. of trees planted on communal land, how much of the communal land has been covered, and what the survival rates on these lands are. The general impression we have is that the communal lands were deliberately ignored by both the project and the local people.

87. The IGA- groups actually have and will increasingly have a considerable positive impact in the project area. The number of beneficairies have amounted to 3500 and therefore comprise around 15 % of the population in the project area. Income on loans are often used for books and for better nutrition and medicine for children. The IG-groups are also trained in child care and nutrition. No impact assessment of the IGA has been made in the area (for example if the income increase has led to better food security in the household).

8.0 Phasing-out Arrangements and Sustainability

88. The phasing-out of a project can be defined as the gradual handing-over of management responsibilities and recurrent costs for externally financed activities to the Government, local organisations or individuals. The speed and success of such a process must be evaluated in relation to several factors :

- the relevance of the activity within current policies
- the capacity of the recipient structure/organisation/administration to take on management, maintenance and economic responsibility
- the nature of the activity (does it involve only the construction of physical structures, or does it involve organisation of groups, awareness and changing of attitudes and behaviour)

89. When reviewing a community development project like the Wogda project, there are some basic comments to make. The components comprising elementary health and education, which are implemented within Government policies and with Government agreement, are in general easier to phase-out than activties in agriculture and environment. This is because there are institutional arrangements made where Ministry of Health and Ministry of

Education respectively have agreed to assign staff and budgets to take over the physical structures and their maintenance. It can of course be questioned whether running costs can be adequately covered by Government budgets, but this is outside the scope for this review.

90. Activities comprising agricultural development and environmental rehabiliation are much more complicated activities to hand-over because they are dependent on climate and biology and therefore demand several growing seasons to show their benefits to the farmers. Innovations and new concepts within farming and environmental rehabilitation demand substantial and consistent technical support and sensitisation as such marginalised farmers are generally risk-averse and initially prefer to strick to the old methods. They are often handed over to individual farmers or farmers organisations which have limited financial and human resources. This issue is specifically delicate in Ethiopia where the development of local organisations is currently in the mold as will be discussed below.

91. When evaluating the phasing-out of environmental rehabilitation activities a general discussion can be introduced on the sharing of responsibilities among local, regional national and international organs. It is well known that farmers are extremely conscious of how they utilise their resources and are reluctant to invest into community lands if they do not forsee substantial returns to themselves individually and collectively.

92. The phasing-out arrangements gives a notion of having reached the objectives of the project. Considering that there has been no assessment of impact on food security and environmental rehabiliation, one can consider the basis for recommending a phasing-out to be lacking. But for these activities, the need in Ethiopia is almost bottomless. Rather than reaching the physical objective which we consider impossible with a time-horizon of less than 20-30 years, one should develop institutional structures that are willing and able to continue these activities.

8.1 Current Changes in Social and Political Setting

Governing bodies

93. The constitution of the country was in the making at the time of the mission. The process was completed when the approved Constitution was handed over to the Government on 12/12/94 by the Constituent Assembly. The most interesting and crucial issues of the Constitution were the following:

1) The creation of autonomous regions on ethnic lines,
2) Regional self-determination up to succession
3) Public and state ownership of both rural and urban lands.

The next important phase in the political development of the country is conducting new elections and installing the governing bodies, expected to be finalized within the first half of 1995.

94. The Regional Governments are destined to exercise far greater autonomy than ever in the past. Structurally, the Constitution empowers them to reorganize their areas of jurisdiction in ways they consider fit for their practical and economic development within the framework of the national structure i.e. state, region, zone and wereda. One example is that bilateral agreements with NGOs are now made only with the regional institutions. Previously it was with the relevant institutions at the central level. While this is very encouraging, it raises a question of capacity and competence for the planning process at regional level. On the positiv, it can get development efforts closer to the local communities where the actions are supposed to take place.

95. Under the present structure, the wereda will continue to be the lowest administrative unit of any region. In other words, the wereda administration will more likely be central for development initiatives targeted at local level. This has been repeatedly underscored in policy debates.

Agricultural Institutions

96. With respect to peasant associations, the social committee of the Woreda has a direct link in their promotion and development. At present the precise role and structure of the peasant associations is not very clear. They continue to operate under the previous mandate as provided by the Land Reform Proclamation of 1975. The original structure seems to be applicable in all parts of the country except in Tigray where they have the Baito system. Accordingly, each PA has jurisdiction over an area of 800 ha with membership made up of all peasants tilling land of not more than 10 ha within the boundary. The PAs were organized at Wereda, Awraja (now Zone), provincial and national levels. The PAs were intended to pursue the following objectives :

i) to implement the land reform and administer public property
ii) to establish service cooperatives
iii) to build schools and clinics
iv) to undertake villagization programs.

97. The team was unable to get any policy indication as to the future policies regarding the PAs. But it is obvious that the past leadership of the PAs have by and large been discredited and replaced for some unpopular roles and association with the previous government. The PAs in the Wogda area are reportedly unaffected presumably because their leaders had little participation in decisions that led to criminal acts. Therefore they continue to maintain credibility to some degree.

98. Unlike the Peasant Asociations, the policies on the formation and development of agricultural cooperatives are clearer and have recently been declared in the Proclamation No 85/1994 titled "Agricultural Cooperative Societies" and issued in February 1994. The main objectives are to organise and assist farmers to increase production and thereby improve their standard of living by introducing new technoligy, better marketing, input distribution and processing of agricultural produce. They are to be established on voluntary basis with membership drawn from and among people within the same profession. It is stated that membership should not be based on political background religion, sex or nationality, and the society should remain non-allied from any political

influence, but governed by democratic principles in accordance with the decision of the General Assembly.

98. The Proclamation defines a society as a primary or a higher level agricultural cooperative society which may engage in either one type of activity or in multipurpose activities and may have a character of either service rendering or producing. The Service Cooperatives in Wogda neatly fall under this definition. Article 46 of the Proclamation offers transitional provisions. Accordingly producers cooperative societies and agricultural service cooperative societies which have been established in accordance with Cooperative Societies Proclamation No.138/1978 and which still are operating, shall be reorganized under this Proclamation. The societies shall continue their operations holding their previous juridical personalities until they are reorganized and registered by the appropriate authority. It is further stated that the appropriate authority shall facilitate all the conditions necessary for the reorganization of the society. In the case of agricultural service cooperatives, the appropriate authority is the Ministry of Agriculture.

99. As noted above, the Proclamation prohibits any interference by government agencies, political parties, individuals or others in the affairs of the societies. Government involvement is to be only for the purpose of strengthening the capability and self-reliance of the societies and make them competitive in the market. The societies should be run as economically independent enterprises. On the other hand, such societies are expected to contribute to community development from their profits in accordance with the decision of the General Meeting or General Assembly of the Society. This is a complete departure from past experiences.

100. Awareness about this Proclamation is very limited. None of the RB-E staff were well aware of it. Sources in the Ministry of Agriculture indicated that preparations were under way to conduct extensive discussions and clarifications at the regional level and below. The team has seen a working document prepared in Amharic which elaborates each of the articles of the new Proclamation.

101. The institution responsible for seed and fertiliser distribution is the Agricultural Inputs Supply Corporation - AISCO (established in 1985, as a monopoly under the responsibility of MOA). Through this the Government controls fertiliser prices, which currently is Birr 145 /quintal (100 kg). For improved seeds the farmers claimed to pay Birr 200 /quintal. Under the current liberalisation policy, the corporation is in the process of privatising part of its wholesale and nearly all of its retail trade. Ethiopian Seed Corporation which supplies state farms with inputs, and being subordinate to the Ministry of State Farms, is also in the process of privatisation. Both institutions are now governed by elected boards and it is stated that the two institutions will eventually merge. This fluctuating institutional situation does have an impact at the project level as needed inputs are not readily available. It is however believed that during the next couple of years these issues would be sorted out.

102. The process of reorientation of the agricultural institutions would evidently take time, especially to reach the Wereda and community levels. RB-E should be encouraged to pick it up from the authorities and help in the dissemination. In

the meanwhile a security net around the farmers would be to continue project support to SC in order to operate efficiently serving the local farmers.

8.2 Phasing out of Project and Sustainability of Actvities and Institutions

103. Phasing-out of the vertisol management activity has commenced through establishing an agreement with MOA to locate an extension agent in the project area. 6 months ago (June 1994) an extension agent from MOA had been located in the area, and was trained by RB-E staff to undertake training of farmers on agricultural issues including vertisol management. Together with one extension agent from MNREP they would cover a total of 6 Peasant Associations. However, there are 26 PAs in the area, and after phase, our extension support to farmers will not be adequate. The introduction of vertisol management is in a positive and rapidly expanding mode. We think it is of utmost importance to continue the support to this activity for some additional years. The project should during these years involve the extension workers and strengthen farmers organisations so that they to a larger extent can be responsible for training and not so dependent on external assistance. A strategy to enhance farmers organisations in input purchase and distribution through training should be developed.

104. The sustainability of the gravity fed irrigation schemes for vegetables seems good as the farmers already seem to be able to manage by themselves.

105. A phasing out of the programme of introduction of fruit trees, through the establishment of a fruit tree nursery, will confront 4 problems ; the difficulty of buying appropriate seeds, the uncertainty of the maintenance and running of the nursery, the absence of a multiplication effect of the activity and the organisation of a fair distribution of seedlings. NORAGRIC would indicate that it is essential to support this activity and to develop a future strategy for the multiplication and sustainability of the activity.

106. As far as the veterinary posts are concerned the arrangement with the Service Cooperatives seem to be sustainable and ready to be phased out. A weak point, however, might be the auditing procedures of MOA as the final institutional set-up for the Service Cooperatives has yet to be settled. As the correct and timely auditing of the Service Cooperatives is vital for continued trust of farmers and the prevention of misuse of funds, it would be needed for RB-E to monitor this activity for some additional time.

107. The phasing out of the project would put an end to terracing work as there would be a limited budget to pay for such work in the MNREP. Also the Government has recently stated that all such work should be based on 95% local participation, which therefore would indicate a much less remuneration than the current 2 Birr/day. As a result of the decentralisation policy, the central ministries will be substantially reduced while the regional administrations will increase. However as many staff of central ministries are reluctant to moving out in the regions, the capacity of the regional administration would be weak. This situation is likely to improve once the constitution has been passed, defining responsibilities between regional and central government and also defining budgets for the regional governments.

108. Another serious issue is the lack of farmer structures and motivation to undertake maintenance of both terracing and gully control measures. Before phasing out the project would need to address this issue and find ways of maintaining the structures that have been built through such hard work.

109. Phasing out of the big tree nurseries will face serious problems, as they currently are run on a grant basis and seedlings are given away. The running costs for the nursery at Genet was estimated to be around Birr 30.000/annually. The price for seedlings produced in plastic pots has been estimated to approximately 15 cents per plant. Survival rates for these plants were estimated to be approximately 80%. In the individual nurseries the price for bare-root seedlings were 5 cents, but the survival rates was only 55% on individual plots and 30% on communal plots. There is a demand for seedlings, especially for eucalyptus which in 5-6 years would yield a stem that could give apprimately 10-15 Birr.

110. An issue in this respect is that the main constraint for the development of individual nurseries is the lack of water. A good argument for keeping the bigger nurseries is that on these sites adequate water is available , and thus it is more efficient to produce a high number of seedlings in these places.

111. Phasing out would necessarily mean that running costs for the big nurseries must be covered either through budgets by the MNREP and/or by selling the seedlings. The MNREP has clearly stated that they are not prepared to take on responsibility for these kinds of running costs, and that they want to promote individual nurseries that can be self-financing. At the moment the Service Cooperatives do not seem to be able to take over the responsibility for the big nurseries either. It can be argued that seedling production for communal lands should be seen as a basic rehabilitation of the natural resource base of Ethiopia and should thus be a subsidised task, while seedlings for income generating activities could be produced on a free market basis. This does however necessitate clearer legal frameworks on the management of communal lands with a clear responsibility and an insentive for the farmers organisations to protect and manage these lands.

112. Phasing out of the water supply component, requires adequate training of local groups to maintain and protect the constructions for spring protection. The general concept of spring protection needs to be transferred to the different farmers groups/villages so that they through improved technology and technical assistance can improve the springs in their area.

113. The emphasis placed on the training of local people can contribute to sustainability. With respect to this, we were given the following facts and accomplishments in completed training:

- crop husbandry	468
- animal husbandry	492
- forestry	568
- water management	90
- pump care-takers	35
- management/accounting	365
- financial control	124
- leadership	345
- TBAs	22
- CBAs	23
- health scouts	350

These are very good initiatives, but may not be enough considering the size of the target population and the complexity of the tasks at hand.

9.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

114. From all indications, the team is convinced that the organization, principles and strategies of RB-E are consistent with the aspirations of the target population and policies of the current Government of Ethiopia (TGE). The goal of rural development defined in the context of the rural poor in Wogda is aimed at reducing the vulnerability of the people. It also addresses ecological and environmental issues which by nature are long term undertakings. This is properly understood by all concerned including the local people as well as the representatives of the line ministers (MOA and MNREP) at the zonal level. Brief discussions held with them revealed their knowledge of the integrated activities and their general support.

115. The organizational set-up and structure of RB-E both at headquarters and field levels are quite impressive. Field staff are well tuned with organizational procedures and the principles behind. There are reasonable facilities at the project Centre and at the satellite camps as well. The staffing situation and arrangement looked very fitting to us. Qualifications appear to be adequate. The team was told that frequent local training is provided including participation in training seminars, field trips and the like. The only reservation expressed was regarding advanced training in Ethiopia and abroad.

116. We have observed that the staff are highly motivated and well acquainted with all components of the project. They work in teams and are very sensitive and observant of the local social norms and cultural factors regardless of their religion or ethnic background. Regarding contacts with research and academic institutions, there is still a long way to go. The team has encouraged the staff at both the headquarter and in the field to give serious thoughts to this matter. NORAGRIC could help to enhance such links using its experience and long standing relations with the academic and scientific institutions in Ethiopia.

117. There is a need to develop a system for the assessment or evaluation and monitoring of project impact on food security and environmental rehabiliation. Such a system would need to include monitroing of how many of the target group has been reached, how their situation has improved with regards to food security (income, food production, capital accumulation etc). For environmental rehabiliation, there is a need for assessing the impact of the tree-planting and soil conservation activities that has been undertaken. With regards to the choice of suitable indicators we would like to refer to the report recently submitted by NORAGRIC on food security indicators.

118. The improved vertisol management scheme seem to be well adapted to the farmers needs. It has, however, only recently been initiated and needs further support from the project staff, both directly to the farmers, but also through the training of the recently recruited extension agent in the area. The scheme is not dependent on enormous amounts of inputs, but the frail input distribution system (through MOA and SCs) could seriously inhibit the farmers to fully benefit from the activity. Sepcifically is this a concern with the avaiability of improved seeds, of which there is a high demand.

119. The gravity fed irrigation schemes seem already to be sustainable and the result for the relatively limited number of households are impressive. The

technology could be transferred to other sites, but is limited due to water availability. A hydrological survey could be undertaken in order to identify additional sites for developing this technology, and the technology could be disseminated to other farmers through farmer to farmer training before phasing-out.

120. The recently established fruit tree nursery has a good potential, but needs more implementation time to get a permanent foothold among the farmers. The institutional arrangements, the dissemination system of plants and the future economy and financial arrangements of the nursery remains unclear and will have to be settled before phase-out.

121. General livestock development activities has been given low priority in the project design from the start of implementation. Except for the supply of veterinary services and distribution of animals to needy households, little has been done. For the beneficiary household the impact on their food security might have been considerable, as a result of increased capital and labour. The impact could however have been much higher, if more emphasis had been given to improved feeding practices.

122. The livestock sector is poor in the area. Unavailability of quality fodder and overgrazing of communal lands is the result. The impact on environmental rehabilitation (considering that over-grazing is a major problem) from the animal husbandry activities chosen in the project must be said to be limited. Changing this situation requires an intensive and long term effort on introduction of fodder herbs and trees and improved feeding practices. Given RB-Es limited time frame for projects, their mandate and targetted households, the limited scope chosen for the animal husbandry components can be understood.

123. Terracing and gully reclamation works are impressive and has visibly had an impact on the reclaiming of cultivable land. However, serious deterioration of the structures is already evident due to lack of maintenance. Current implementation is done on a 50-50 shared basis, where the project pays 2 Birr/day for the construction work while farmers are required to pay 2 Birr worth of work per day. The continuation for such work seems likely to be outside the budgetary capacity of the MNREP and the population does not seem adquately motivated to undertake terracing without compensation. The lack of maiantenance is an issue of serious concern, and must be dealt with through awareness building and organisation of farmers groups with responsibility for this. The project can not be phased out before instutional arrangements for maintenance is ensured.

124. The impact of the massive tree-planting that has been undertaken in the area, needs to be assessed. The initial diversity of species, have through the project years been reduced to only comprise eucalyptus and hops. The promotion of fodder trees is almost none. As most of these plants have been used for income-generating activities on individual lands, the environmental rehabilitation of the communal lands/grazing lands has been limited. This is due to the disincentives of the previous land tenure regulations which hopefully will be changes under the current administration.

125. The phasing out of the nurseries confront serious problems, as MNREP do not have budgets to continue the current, highly subsidised, nurseries. RB-E should before phasing-out develop different strategies to solve this problem. Negotiations with MNREP could provide a certain subsidy level, the nursery could be divided into several smaller units owned by individuals, the activity could be handed over as a private enterprise to the SCs.

126. Water supply has been restricted to the protection of springs. This technology could probably be disseminated to other water-sources and adapted to the needs of the villagers.

127. Womens Income-generating activities groups have just recently been established (1991). The relative remoteness of Wogda has left the women un-exposed for economic activities. Continued support would therefore be important before they are left to themselves. A sustainable system of supervision of accounts must be established before phase-out and the problem of legal framework for IGA-groups must be solved.

128. The above conslusions and recommendations all point in one direction : for the sake of the sustainability of the components financed through SSE-funds, the project should not be phased out in 1995. It is difficult to recommend a specific number of years needed to obtain an appropriate level of sustainability when there has been no assessment of the impact already achieved. NORAGRIC would therefore recommend that SSE-funded activities should at least continue for 2 more years. Further extension should be based on an assessment of both impact and the viability and ability of the institutions responsible for continuing the concerned activities.

Annex 1

Date : 2 November 1994

To: Helge Espe, Norwegian Save the Children
Eldny Bredde, NORAD
Trygve Berg, NORAGRIC
Aragay Waktola, NORAGRIC
Jon Kristian Øiestad, NORAGRIC
Sidsel Grimstad, NORAGRIC

Terms of Reference : Review of the Conservation and Rural Development Project in Tegulet and Bulga Wereda, Northern Shoa, Ethiopia

Background

1. The Norwegian Save the Children (Redd Barna-Ethiopia) implemented project in Wogda, titled "Conservation and Rural Development Project, Tegulet and Bulga Wereda, Northern Shoa" was initiated in 1987. The main objectives of the project have been food security and environmental rehabilitation, as well to improve health and education.The project activities concerning agriculture and environmental rehabilitation have been financed by the SSE-funds since the beginning. While a major private contributor, the "Lions Club Norway", has funded activities in health and education.

2. According to the latest reports from Redd Barna-Ethiopia (1993), the project activities, such as terracing, tree planting and other soil conservation measures carried out on a Food-for Work and Cash-for-Work basis has improved the food security situation to such an extent that Wogda is now self-sufficient with food. Redd Barna also reports that local institutions and organisations now are sufficiently strengthened to stand on their own, and can take over project activities. Similarly health and education standards have reached a sufficient level as per the objectives of the project. Redd Barna has therefore decided that it will phase out its assistance in Wogda during 1995.

3. It is on this background that NORAGRIC suggested a review of the project, before the final year of funding. The main objectives of the mission would be to review the activities that led to the positive results claimed by Redd Barna and how they have been implemented. NORAGRIC perceives it to be important to learn from the experience gained in this project in order to share these lessons with other NGOs. Another major objective would be to look into the phasing out arrangements that will be implemented next year. Specific focus would be on ensuring that sustainability for project initiated activities are obtained.

4. NORAGRIC will only review the components that have been financed through the SSE-Programme; which are the following : Agriculture development, Animal Husbandry, Forestry / Soil Conservation Measures,

Water Supply. The target population has been 26 peasant associations comprising around 26.000 people. Amongs these, the project activities have been targetted towards single-headed households and poor families with many children. The main objectives have been to improve the food security situation and povert aleviation, the main activity in this respect has been to promote income-generating activities through establishing womens groups and credit facilities.

5. The specific terms of reference are outlined below :

1. Regarding Agricultural Development, the team will review :

- The results achieved in relation to set objectives
- The design of the activities and institutional measures that has been implemented in order to enhance food security
- The strategy and measures taken to reduce the dependency on food-for-work/cash-for-work and other types of project-induced inputs in the area
- The indicators used by Redd Barna to measure food security in the project area
- The measures taken to strengthen local institutions and organisations in order to phase out project activities
- The collaboration with local technical services
- External factors that have had an impact on food security

2. Regarding Animal Husbandry, the team will review :

- The results achieved in relation to set objectives
- The design of the activities and institutional measures that has been implemented in order to enhance food security
- The strategy and measures taken to reduce the dependency on food-for-work/cash-for-work and other types of project-induced inputs in the area
- The indicators used by Redd Barna to measure food security in the project area
- The measures taken to strengthen local institutions and organisations in order to phase out project activities
- The future availability of veterinary services

3. Regarding Soil Conservation and Afforestation, the team will review :

- The results achieved in relation to set objectives
- The design of the activities and institutional measures that has been implemented in order to enhance environmental rehabilitation
- The strategy and measures taken to reduce the dependency on food-for-work/cash-for-work for the carrying out of these activities
- The measures taken to strengthen local institutions and organisations and the maintenance of existing structures in order to phase out project activities
- The type of collaboration with local/regional authorities, to ensure that measures are implemented in accordance with overall policies and with the future support of technical services

4. Regarding Water Supply, the team will review :

- The results achieved in relation to set objectives

- The institutional measures that has been taken to manage water supply and maintenance of these structures after phasing out

5. Regarding Income-Generating Activities, the team will review :

- The results achieved in relation to set objectives
- The design of the scheme and its sustainability
- The institutional measures including human resources strengthening that will be implemented when phasing out the project

Composition, Time and Place of Review Mission

5. The NORAGRIC team would comprise Trygve Berg , Aragay Waktola and Sidsel Grimstad (Mission Leader) and will be undertaken in conjunction with other duties all the three mission members have in Ethiopia during the same period of time. It will, during the period 16 - 19 November 1994, visit Addis Abeba and the project area and, as appropriate for Redd Barna, give a preliminary report at the Redd Barna headquarters during the following week.

6. The team would upon return produce a short report for NORAD in compliance with the above-mentioned Terms of Reference.

Annex 2

List of documents

Redd Barna-Ethiopia -	25 years of work for the best interest of Children Prepared for the 25 Years Jubilee Seminar held in June 1994
Redd Barna-Ethiopia -	The 25 Years Jubilee Report 1969 - 94
Redd Barna-Ethiopia -	Evaluation Report on Soil Conservation Works of Herena Rural Development Project P.4009 By Ato Azene Bekele, June 26, 1990
Redd Barna-Ethiopia -	Local Programme Handbook - Operational Guidelines
Redd Barna- Ethiopia -	Annual Reports from 1992 and 1993
NORAGRIC - University of Bergen DECO	Report from Baseline Study of Redd Barna Ethiopia's Conservation and Rural Development Project in Goshe Bado/Aragesh Area, Shewa Region, Ethiopia. September 1986
NORAGRIC -	Integrated Rural Development Project in Wolaita, The SSE-Programme. Report of a visit to Redd Barna Ethiopia's Wolaita Project November 1993
DECO -	Community Development and Socio-Cultural Factors, the Wolaita and Wogda Projects. Janne Lexow, Oslo July 1988
Helland, Johan -	Internal Review of the Soil Conservation and Community Development Project in Wogda, Ethiopia. Addis Abeba, April 1989.